# ORDER SHEET West Bengal Administrative Tribunal

Present.The Hon'ble Justice Ranjit Kumar Bag &
The Hon'ble Dr. Subesh Kumar Das

#### Case No. OA - 164 of 2018

S	Srabani Sen Versus The State of We	st Bengal & Ors.
Serial No. and date of order	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary.
04 26/02/2019	For the Applicant  : Mrs. Madhumita Patra, Ld. Advocate.	3
	For the State Respondent: Mr. A.L. Basu, Ld. Advocate.	
	Affidavit of Service filed on behalf of the applicant today is kept on record.	
	The applicant has prayed for direction upon the	
	respondents for granting him promotion to the post of Associate Professor by creating a vacancy in the	
	promotional post.	
	It appears from the materials on record that the	
	applicant got promotion to the post of Assistant	
	Professor, Department of Nuclear and Experimental	
	Medical Science, IPGME&R, Kolkata from the Feeder post of RMO-cum-Clinical Tutor on May 24, 2010. The	
	contention of the applicant is that she was eligible for	
	promotion to the post of Associate Professor,	
	Department of Nuclear Medicine, IPGME&R, Kolkata	
	on August 08, 2014 in response to circular dated July	
	08, 2014, but she was denied promotion to the post of	
	Associate Professor. The grievance of the applicant is	
	that one Gouranga Kanti Rakshit was appointed as	
	Associate Professor, Department of Nuclear Medicine,	
	IPGME&R, Kolkata by order dated May 20, 2014.	

_	3 T
Form	No.

														,	S	<b>`</b>	r	8	a	ł	c	8	a	1	า	i		(	5	$\epsilon$	):	r	l															
•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•		•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	

Vs

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. **OA - 164 of 2018** 

Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal	Office action with date
date of order	with signature	and dated signature of
		parties when necessary.
1	2	3

With the above factual matrix, Learned Counsel for the applicant contends that the applicant was not duly considered for promotion to the post of Associate Professor, inspite of fulfilling eligibility criteria for promotion to the post of Associate Professor. On the other hand, Mr. Basu, Learned Counsel representing the state respondents has referred to the norms for granting promotion to the Associate Professor reflected in memo no. ME/PROM-02-2014/M/1240 dated July 08, 2014 issued by the Principal Secretary to the Government of West Bengal, Department of Health & Family Welfare and submitted that the applicant did not fulfill eligibility criteria for promotion to the post of Associate Professor when the vacancy of Associate Professor in the Department of Nuclear Medicine, IPGME&R, Kolkata was filled up in 2014.

Having heard Learned Counsel representing both parties and on consideration of paragraph 'A' (2) of the memo dated July 08, 2014, we find that the eligibility criteria for filling up the post of Associate Professor from the Feeder post of Assistant Professor are as follows:

• "For the post of Associate Professor: (i) as least four years service in WBMES as

Form No.

														,	S	S	r	•	а	ιI	t	)	E	ı	1		1	Ĺ		5	5	$\epsilon$	2	r	1																
• •	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•		•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•		•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	٠	

Vs

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. <b>OA</b> –	164 of 2018	
Serial No. and date of order	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date and dated signature of
1	2	parties when necessary.
1	Assistant Professor in the concerned	3
	discipline in a State Medical College for	
	disciplines included under Specialties group	
	and at least two years service in WBMES as	
	Assistant Professor in a State Medical College	
	for disciplines included under	
	Superspecialities group: (ii) A minimum of two	
	research publications in the journals indexed	
	with index Medicus/Journals at the National	
	Level of the National Academic Organizations	
	[MCI-12(2)/2009-Med22654 Dated 21-07-	
	2009] provided that each research publication	
	is published/accepted [MCI-12(2)/2009-Med.	
	MISC./56925 dated 15-12-2009] for	
	publication in the Journals by the National	
	Associations/Societies of the respective	
	specialties. Further provided that the	
	requirement of 2 research publications for	
	promotion to the post of Associate Professor	
	would be fulfilled with 2 research publications	
	which must be published during the tenure of	
	the Assistant Professor [MCI-12(2)/2009-	
	Med. MISC./56925 dated 15-12-2009]."	
	On scrutiny of the above norms for promotion to	
	the post of Associate Professor from the Feeder post of	
	Assistant Professor, we find that the applicant should	

Form No.

																S	١.	r	6	ı	ł	)	6	3	1	า	i		5	5	$\epsilon$	)]	n	L															
•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•		•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•		•	•	•	•	•	•

 $V_{S}$ 

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. <b>OA</b> –	164 of 2018	
Serial No. and date of order	Order of the Tribunal	Office action with date and dated signature of
date of order	with signature	parties when necessary.
1	2	3
	have served at least for 4 (four) years in WBMES as	
	Assistant Professor in the concerned discipline under	
	specialities group in a State Medical College and	
	should have served for at least 2 (two) years in	
	WBMES as Assistant Professor in a State Medical	
	College in the concerned discipline under Super	
	Specialities group and 2 (two) Research Publication in	
	the journals indexed with index Medicus/Journals at	
	the National Level organization. The applicant has	
	unambiguously pointed out in her application that	
	she served only for about 4 (four) years as Assistant	
	Professor in the Department of Nuclear and	
	Experimental Medical Science, when the vacancy in	
	the promotional post of Associate Professor in the	
	Department of Nuclear Medicine was filled up in the	
	year 2014. The logical inference of our above	
	observation is that the applicant did not fulfill	
	eligibility criteria for promotion to the post of	
	Associate Professor from the Feeder post of Assistant	
	Professor and as such the applicant was not granted	
	promotion to the post of Associate Professor in the	
	year 2014 when Gouranga Kanti Rakshit got the	
	promotion as Associate Professor in the Department of	
	Nuclear Medicine, IPGME&R, Kolkata. The applicant	
	is not entitled to get any relief in the present	
	application. The original application is, thus,	

Form No.	Sı	rabani Sen
	••••••	••••••
		Vs
	The State of We	st Bengal & Ors.
Case No. <b>OA</b> –	•••••	••••••••••••
Serial No. and date of order	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date and dated signature of
1	2	parties when necessary.
1	dismissed.	<u> </u>
	Let a <b>Plain Copy</b> of the order be supplied to both parties.	
	S. K. DAS R. K. BAG MEMBER(A) MEMBER(J)	
Com		
Csm		